Public trust beyond the hype!

Caroline Brall & Felix Gille, Postdocs
ETH Zurich, Department of Health Sciences and Technology, Health Ethics & Policy Lab
Essential Public Health Operations

EPHO6: Assuring governance for health

Editorial | Published: 29 February 2020

Public trust: caught between hype and need

Felix Gille & Caroline Brall

International Journal of Public Health (2020) | Cite this article
Let's travel 2019-2020
Morning: bathroom
Packing my luggage
Train to Zurich Airport
Zurich Airport
On the airplane to Düsseldorf
Düsseldorf Airport: supermarket

Vertrauen ist gut, Kontrolle ist besser.

Kein Verkauf von Alkohol und Tabakwaren an Jugendliche.

Wir ♥ Lebensmittel.
On my smartphone

Vertrauenskrise

Du musst mir vertrauen!

Wirtschaftswoche

Von Jutta Almendinger und Jan Wetzel
15. März 2020

Nach Datenmanipulation: Novartis schwächt Vertrauen in Forschung

Von Andreas Möckli - CH Media • 10.8.2019 um 05:00 Uhr

Wirtschaftsnobelpreisträger fordern mehr Vertrauen in den Staat

daenaugeneragentur — 15. März 2020, 17.28 Uhr — Zuletzt aktualisiert: 15. März 2020, 17.30 Uhr

Influencer – es geht um Vertrauen

Trust hype?!
Well, we need public trust
Vaccination

- Lower trust in national government links to no history of vaccination (Miyachi et al., 2020)
- Public trust in medical organizations is a crucial determinant of influenza vaccination behavior… → restoring trust between public and medical organization seems to be essential for the management of future pandemics. (Gilles et al., 2011)
- Multiple levels of trust: Trust in product, provider, policy-maker (Larson et al., 2018)


Health policy during economic crisis
- Trust as seen by policy-makers

Findings from an interview study:

- Acceptance of priority-setting in health policy depends on public trust (Brall et al. 2019).
- Lack of trust is described as being a major failure for effective health policy-making.
- Policy-makers who act according to values that are publicised and they “stick to” are more trusted than others.
Care.data (2013-2016), a failed big data initiative (NHS England)

- Trust was influenced by: default opt in; privacy and data security concerns; involvement of private companies; confusing communication strategy (Gille, 2017)

- Needed: Warrants of trust and social licence.

- Conditions for social licence include:
  - reciprocity
  - non-exploitation
  - service of the public good (Carter et al. 2015).


What is public trust?

How does public trust develop?
What constitutes public trust in the health system?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Conceptualising themes</th>
<th>Explanation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Active regulatory systems</td>
<td>If regulatory systems are in place, then people trust more.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anonymity</td>
<td>If private data is anonymised before shared within the health care system, then people trust more.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Autonomy</td>
<td>If health system actors enable people to maintain autonomy, then people trust more.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Benefit to others</td>
<td>If action is benefiting others, then people trust more.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Certainty about the future</td>
<td>If researchers and officials do the best they can do to foresee risk in the future, then people trust more.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Familiarity</td>
<td>If people have positive experiences with the health care system, then people trust more.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General perception of security</td>
<td>If the health care system is perceived to be secure, then people trust more.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gut feeling</td>
<td>If peoples' gut feeling 'tells' them to trust, people trust more.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health system benefit</td>
<td>If action is benefiting the health care system, then people trust more.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information quality</td>
<td>If truthful and honest information is provided, then people trust more.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal benefit</td>
<td>If action is benefiting the individual, then people trust more.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Privacy</td>
<td>If people's privacy is maintained, then people trust more.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public financial benefit</td>
<td>If health care system’s action is benefiting the public health care system, then people trust more.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recognised potential of the healthcare system</td>
<td>If a potential is recognised in the health care system, then people trust more.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Respect</td>
<td>If the public and the health care system respect each other, then people trust more.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time</td>
<td>If action is not rushed, then people trust more.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Why does the public trust the health system?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Benefit to others</th>
<th>Personal benefit</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Health system benefit</td>
<td>Public financial benefit</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
What are the effects of public trust?

Participation

Legitimisation
A definition of public trust in the health system

PUBLIC TRUST grows in the public sphere from open public discourse and as a result legitimises the actions of the health care system. Public trust builds on information equally relating to past experiences, present perceptions and future expectations. Public trust is established in anticipation of a net benefit for the public as well as the system.
COVID-19
COVID 19: trust in the news and on Twitter

DEUTSCHLAND UND CORONA

In einem Land, das stillsteht

EIN KOMMENTAR VON FRANK PERGANDER, BERLIN  ·  AKTUALISIERT AM 15.03.2020  ·  08:38

Umgekehrt zeigt die Gesellschaft ein erstaunliches Vertrauen in die Politik, wenn es um die Bewältigung der Coronakrise geht. Dabei schien es bislang so, als wäre dieses Vertrauen längst verloren. Krisen schärfen manchmal den Blick.

Ilona Kickbusch Retweeted

Paul Belcher @PaulJBelcher · 33m

#BorisJohnson grapples to control #coronavirus message | "a case study of the complexities of epidemiological theory colliding brutally with the 24-hour news cycle, social media, and deep levels of mistrust in politicians."

Richard Horton
@richardhorton1

Please read and support our letter in The Times today calling on the UK government to share the evidence, data, and models on which it is basing its policies. Without complete openness the public’s trust will be lost.

Peter Dabrock liked

Sachar Klein @sachark · 5h

Ich finde #Corona auch Kacke, aber ich habe unendlich viel Vertrauen in Merkel und ihr Kabinett, dass sie die richtigen Entscheidungen treffen werden. Zum Glück regiert noch die Bundeskanzlerin.
Responding to the corona virus

Trust is a central element for public adherence to public health measures

- Open and timely communication with the public
- Transparent decision-making
- Collaboration with scientists and experts in the field

‘Timely, accurate, and transparent risk communication is essential and challenging in emergencies because it determines whether the public will trust authorities more than rumours and misinformation.’ (Legido-Quigley et al., 2020)

Public health ethics framework to foster trust

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Principle</th>
<th>Question to assess</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Non-maleficence</td>
<td>✓ Is harm prevented by the public health measure?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beneficence</td>
<td>✓ Is it of any good to every single person affected?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health maximisation</td>
<td>✓ Does it improve population health?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>✓ Does it have a long-term effect on the public’s health?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Efficiency</td>
<td>✓ Is it cost-effective? What about opportunity-costs?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Respect for autonomy</td>
<td>✓ Is there ‘informed consent’? Are privacy and personal data respected?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>✓ If the intervention is paternalistic, is this justifiable?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Justice</td>
<td>✓ Does it prevent social and health inequalities? Are vulnerable sub- populations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>considered and supported?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>✓ Is the institution proposing the intervention publicly justified and acting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>transparently?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proportionality</td>
<td>✓ Is the intervention the least infringing of possible alternatives?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>✓ Are costs and utility proportional?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Wrap up: Governance implications

Public health governance
- should be informed by evidence and expertise
- should take into account ethical and societal considerations to act in line with public values
- should be communicated transparently

Public trust:
- truthful and honest communication
- free choice
Reading suggestions & References

Let’s discuss!
ZOOM: Chat

felix.gille@hest.ethz.ch
caroline.brall@hest.ethz.ch

Follow us on 🦅: @phe_trust